

New Hampshire
State Board of Education
Minutes of the January 12, 2023, Meeting

AGENDA ITEM I. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the State Board of Education convened at 10:05 a.m. Drew Cline presided as Chair.

Members present: Ryan Terrell, Phil Nazzaro, Ann Lane, Sally Griffin (remote) and Drew Cline (chair). Richard Sala and Kate Cassady were not in attendance due to prior commitments. Also in attendance were Commissioner of Education, Frank Edelblut and Deputy Commissioner, Christine Brennan.

AGENDA ITEM II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Drew Cline led the pledge of allegiance.

AGENDA ITEM III. PUBLIC COMMENT

Bill Furbush, Superintendent of Epping School District, shared concern over a collective bargaining agreement in Epping that failed by 25 votes. The vote was due to an inability by community members to pay their taxes. Education continues to get more expensive. He shared concern that the system is not sustainable. He lost 21 teachers due to the loss of funding.

Michael Tursi, Superintendent of Shaker Regional School District, highlighted student leadership opportunities and achievements. At Belmont High School, a student leadership group was created with the goal to incorporate student voices into decision making and designing the future of the school. The group analyzed the school mascot image and whether it met the two general goals of having a mascot: representing and unifying the school and community. The group decided the profile view of a native American did not represent these goals. They presented a new mascot to the Shaker Regional School Board. The new mascot is a red fox. Students at Canterbury Elementary School engaged in learning about the U.S. Constitution. Teachers and students shared hopes and dreams for the new school year. They collaborated to generate rules that would allow all class members to achieve these hopes and dreams. They created a classroom constitution and developed a student delegate group representing grades K-5. The team of delegates created a schoolwide constitution.

Lillian (Lilly) Oncoro, a junior at Franklin High School, stated she won the title of Outstanding Teen. She was required to come up with a social impact initiative. She came up with the initiative, Music Education and Unity (ME&U). She shared a brochure with board members.

Reuben Duncan, Superintendent of Jaffrey-Rindge Cooperative School District, provided handouts to board members. The district's mission is to inspire, engage, and empower all learners to thrive in their lives and community. The district has shifted to an innovative ecosystem model which focuses on empowering the teachers and schools to make decisions. The goal is to build together rather than creating buy in. A leadership academy was created for teachers giving all teachers the opportunity to grow and lead in their own way. They have a partnership with Franklin Pierce University and are working on an additional MOU on graduate level learners and internships.

AGENDA ITEM IV. PRESENTATIONS/REPORTS/UPDATES

A. Canterbury Withdrawal Feasibility Initial Study Report

Canterbury has requested an extension for one year. The Board previously not sure if they were able to grant a one-year extension or multiple 180-day extensions. After review of the law, there is no allowance for granting multiple extensions.

Canterbury representative stated two warrant articles were prepared. One for if the Board granted the extension and one for if they did not.

AGENDA ITEM V. COUNCIL FOR TEACHER EDUCATION (CTE)

A. Keene State College (KSC) – program approval

Laura Stoneking, NHED, Administrator, Bureau of Educator Preparation and Higher Education, introduced Dr. Tanya Sturtz, Director of Educator Preparation (KSC), Dr. Steve Bigaj, Coordinator for Graduate Education (KSC), and Kathryn McCurdy, representing Council for Teacher Education (CTE).

Laura Stoneking stated KSC went through an Option 4 Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) review. KSC's programs are currently all CAEP accredited.

Ann Lane stated in July 2022, the State Board approved the elimination of a series of programs at University of New Hampshire (UNH). Some of those same programs are being approved for KSC. She asked why KSC is more successful in getting enrollment for these programs or if the needs of the state have changed in 6 months. Tanya Sturtz responded the enrollment numbers are included in the report. KSC is known for its teacher prep programs, which results in a large population of education students. Education is the largest major at KSC.

Chair Cline stated there has been declines in enrollment in teacher prep programs across the state. The report shows similar trends in that elementary education has the largest enrollment. He asked how KSC sees the connection

between where students are enrolling, and the critical shortage area needs of school districts. Tanya Sturtz responded the biggest form of recruitment into education is based upon former teachers. The decrease in interest in secondary education could be a result of the stress in schools at the secondary level. KSC are increasing recruitment efforts focusing on science and math. Chair Cline asked if there are any conversations to encourage applicants to go to the shortage areas in terms of ease of finding positions in those fields. Tanya Sturtz stated all options are discussed with applicants. Most students can get jobs in all areas, but options are still encouraged. Steve Bigaj added they have a lot of discussion at the graduate level for career shifters.

Chair Cline asked about the programs with limited enrollment and how KSC makes decisions about when to end a program. Tanya Sturtz responded science education is currently on hold, but she is constantly asking to bring it back. Modern language is also being taught out.

Ryan Terrell asked about the four tenants and the mission statement goals in terms of the learning needs of diverse populations. Tanya Sturtz responded diversity includes ethnicity, race, social economic, disabilities, etc. In the methods and field experiences, students get to know the population and needs of multiple schools to understand how meeting the needs differs between schools. Steve Bigaj added special ed curriculum is being integrated into general education programs.

Ryan Terrell asked about reference in the tenants to the political nature of education. Tanya Sturtz responded all 100 level courses are aimed to prepare students for the realities of what is happening in schools. The courses touch on the laws, funding, and how to meet student needs. Elementary education students are required to take a social justice course to challenge the views they grew up with and to think critically.

Ryan Terrell stated that the vision statement says, the vision of the educator preparation program is to graduate professionals in the field of education who are advocates for social justice and equity. Tanya Sturtz stated some of the language may need to be reviewed and updated. Ann Lane stated the language suggests the focus is on creating advocates for social justice and equity, there may be a failure to create individuals who can effectively reach every child.

Chair Cline asked for the definition of social justice. Tanya Sturtz responded there are multiple classes that can be used to meet the social justice requirement. Classes include education in emergencies, sociology, critical ethnic studies, women, and gender studies. Tanya Sturtz's personal definition of social justice is understanding everything happening around us and being open to understanding both perspectives before making a choice or moving forward. Steve Bagaj added the overall purpose is to meet the needs of all students.

Sally Griffin asked where future science and math teachers are coming from. Tanya Sturtz responded there are more site-based licensing in those areas for people who are changing careers. Solving the problem requires advocating the areas in high schools.

Phil Nazzaro stated there is a political nature to some of the language in the mission statement. There is a shortage of people who want to be teachers. He asked if there is a possibility of potential candidates being alienated who do not want to be part of the ongoing political division in the country. Tanya Sturtz stated the language was put together years ago and is on the website. However, when representatives go into the classrooms, language being used is different and there are larger conversations. She is noting the comments being made by the Board surrounding the language. The mission statement has not been reviewed and Tanya Sturtz will investigate the language. Steve Bagaj stated the CAEP accreditation language has a strong theme around diversity, equity, and inclusion. The site visit assessed the institution critically on how well they meet those areas. That is a driving force of how to frame their mission and work.

Chair Cline suggested tabling the discussion to get more information including course descriptions. Laura Stoneking stated if there is not an approval at the February meeting, the programs will expire. Chair Cline stated conditional approval can be given in February to extend the deadline if there are still concerns. The Board has concerns over certain courses.

Phil Nazzaro suggested a conditional approval now rather than waiting for February. Laura Stoneking stated conditional approval is typically based upon unmet standards and asked what standards are currently unmet that the institution needs to correct. Tanya Sturtz stated some of the courses have been discontinued, but there is a lag in updating course descriptions, getting the course catalog updated, and then updating the website.

Ryan Terrell stated that he is unhappy with a lot of the language. However, he understands that there is a critical need for teachers. He stated he would be very disappointed if the programs were approved, and changes were not made by KSC in terms of language and requirements. Laura Stoneking questioned what administrative rule under the ed prep rules, does KSC not have.

Chair Cline responded a rule does not have to be stated to give conditional approval. A request for more information is also a valid reason to grant conditional approval. Tanya Sturtz stated a 6-month approval would give KSC time to update their language and report back to the Board. Sally Griffin would also like to see efforts to increase recruitment for math and science.

Chair Cline requested a vote to table while the Board seeks information from counsel.

After obtaining advice from counsel, Chair Cline shared based upon the State Board of Education rules, there are four possible approvals. This approval is under the national accreditation approval, which only gives the option to approve or not approve the programs. There is no option for a short-term approval or extension. The only option is to table it until February or approve the program. A decision will be made prior to the program expiration.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education table the discussion.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

B. Rivier University – substantive change

Laura Stoneking introduced Dr. Diane Monico, Director of Ed Prep at Rivier, and Dr. John Gleason, Dean. Over the past 2-3 years, work has been done to collate documentation in educator preparation (PEPP) at the Department and streamline processes. In 2013/2014, there was shift in how PEPP approvals were documented and reported to the public. When that shift occurred, something went awry with Rivier. The licensure only option for their programs had been inadvertently taken off their roster and the accompanying document is missing. The Council for Teacher Education (CTE) asked Rivier to provide the process used to analyze transcript analysis and requirements for licensure for post-graduate, licensure only pathways.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education accept and approve the substantive change to reinstate the licensure only pathway for all 14 PEPPs with alignment of December 30, 2026, expiration date.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

AGENDA ITEM VI. PUBLIC HEARINGS

Public hearings opened at 11:01 a.m. and closed at 11:41 a.m. with no public comment.

A. Undergrad Prep Program Standards (Ed 612.03, Ed 612.15, Ed 612.20, Ed 612.30)

B. Comprehensive Agriculture Educator (Ed 507.04)

C. Administrator Prep Programs (Ed 614.04, Ed 614.05)

Public hearings opened at 11:41 a.m. and closed at 12:13 p.m. with no public comment.

D. Interpreter/Transliterater (Ed 504.11)

E. Speech Language Specialist & Business Administrator Preparation Programs (Ed 614.09, Ed 614.12)

F. Comprehensive Business Educator (Ed 507.49)

AGENDA ITEM VII. BUREAU OF CREDENTIALING OPPORTUNITIES

A. Office of Charter Schools

1. Academy of Science and Design Public Charter School – charter amendment

Jen Cava, Director, stated the Academy of Science and Design (ASD) is in its 16th year of operation. She has been director for 12 years. Also in attendance was Melissa Merhalski, Development Coordinator and Admissions, Kym Harmon, Business Manager, Rick Bartle, Chairman of the Board, Ken Johnson, Board, and Ryan Hale, Board of Trustees.

Jen Cava shared ASD is a STEM focused, chartered public school located in Nashua. They serve students grades 6-12. When the school opened, there were 30 students. They have expanded to 550 students. They secured their own building. They are requesting to add 5th grade to the program and expand enrollment cap from 600 students to 800 students.

The primary reason for adding 5th grade is the enhancement of the program. Early exposure to STEM has advantages and gives them a strong foundation to be successful. They will start with a small pilot program to ensure mindful, intentional growth. Many students who enroll in 6th grade come during the natural change from elementary to middle school. Some elementary schools end after 4th grade. Students who want to attend ASD must then go to a middle school for one year before transferring. Offering 5th grade would allow a smooth transition for more students. The increase in maximum enrollment will allow the school flexibility as they expand. A cap of 800 allows the absorption of 5th grade and growing as driven by enrollment.

Rick Bartle stated the board looks to be able to serve a larger community. There are 34 towns represented in the school's population, but they want to serve more. Space was previously a restriction, which was solved when they bought a building that doubles space. The board then considered how to create a logical approach to growing. The amendments are part of a larger strategy to meet the

needs of the most students possible. The addition of 5th grade is mapped out over 5 years to see how it is integrated into population of the school.

Ann Lane asked the success of students who come at higher grade levels compared to a student who starts in 6th grade. Jen Cava responded a large entry point is 9th grade from schools all over the state with very different levels of preparation. Staff meet with new families prior to starting at the school to help them understand how students will progress through the program based upon their needs. Information is reinforced throughout the middle school years. Summer school programs are offered to help students transitioning into the school.

Chair Cline asked why they did not ask for 1200 students now that the space has doubled. Rick Bartle responded there are ideas on how to use the extra space other than with classrooms. For example, they might have a robotics lab or something similar. A lecture space may allow guest lecturers or larger populations.

Chair Cline asked if they have considered opening additional locations based on their success over the past 16 years. The program would be beneficial to NH students. Rick Bartle responded there have been conversations in the strategic planning committees about the future. One challenge is access to funding. Purchasing the new building has empowered the board to consider the possibility of a second location in the future.

Ryan Terrell asked for a best practice that families can utilize to support STEM learning at home. Jen Cava responded a strength for their school is the teachers are very passionate and think outside of the box to create learning experiences for students. The passion of the teachers and the excitement it passes onto students build their confidence.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education approve the amendments of the Academy of Science and Designs Chartered Public School charter.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

B. Learn Everywhere Programs

1. Izzit.org - renewal

Tim Carney, NHED, stated Izzit.org is requesting a 5-year renewal. Dean Graziano, Vice President, shared the student page is ready to go and applications are open. Three parents have requested information. As students apply, they receive an email offering orientation for families. The class is high in rigor. He plans to be personally available to support students twice a week in the afternoon

and evening. The program will include feedback from students at the end of the semester to constantly keep improving.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education approve the Izzit.org Learn Everywhere renewal application.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

2. XR Terra – new application

Tim Carney requested the Board consider the 1-year approval of the XR Terra Learn Everywhere application. Marc Dean Millot, Advisory Director, stated XR Terra is an online training company in virtual and augmented reality. It started in 2019 around bootcamps to train individuals who were interested in entering the field, which lacked educational roots. Dean has experience in public school reform, school improvement, and education technology. They have been interested in high school to give students a learning setting they could never go to on their own.

The company received a grant from the 3M foundation in Minneapolis to start a high school course teaching students how to create and experience augmented reality environments. Another grant was received from The Verizon Foundation for training K-12 teachers to use XR in the classroom. They have been working on getting grant for a high school summer grant. They have a relationship with World Academy because they have experience bringing education topics down to a lower level. They offer a free high school teacher course, which has not been as popular.

Ryan Terrell asked which sectors of the economy where AR could be adopted. Dean responded the largest AR driven games Roblox and Minecraft each have roughly 100 million users a month. Half of each of those users are 16 and under. This shows a culture changing trend as kids are becoming literate in XR. AR developing jobs are increasing. The fastest growing area is in manufacturing, manufacturing design, and maintenance/repair of manufacturing. In medical, training could take place virtually.

The trainings do not incorporate headsets or visual devices into the training because when creating the experience, the added value of the headset is minimal. The headset technology may also become obsolete.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Sally Griffin, that the State Board of Education approve the XR Terra LLC Learn Everywhere application.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

AGENDA ITEM VIII. LEGISLATIVE UPDATES

A. Initial Proposal – ESOL Teacher (Ed 507.17)

Julie Shea, NHED, Administrative Rules Coordinator, introduced Beth McClure, Professional Standards Board (PSB) subcommittee chair, and NHED colleague Wendy Perron. Steve Appleby, NHED, Division Director was also in attendance.

Ann Lane asked about language on page 6 of the initial proposal to make it easier to understand. Beth McClure responded the idea is allowing students to meet competencies, but their language does not have to be perfect. Julie Shea added from a rule's perspective, technical language can be used if it will be understood by someone who is teaching ESOL. Chair Cline suggested the subcommittee try to simplify the language prior to the final proposal.

Julie Shea stated there was previous discussion about language in C1(e). Chair Cline specified the language is not clear considering they are the requirements a teacher must demonstrate. He asked if applicants will be expected to demonstrate the requirements and if so, how they would be able to do that. Beth McClure responded the goal is to set out the competencies for the licensure. It is up to the intuitions of higher education (IHE) or mentor to assess. The candidate could create a paper to describe the characteristics.

Phil Nazzaro noted language in paragraph 2. Some of the language reads like activities rather than objectives. Beth McClure responded they varied language to keep from being repetitive but agreed examine is not a measurable objective. The Board and guests discussed measurable language in the initial proposal.

Chair Cline asked about the use of the word advocacy on page 3 of the initial proposal. Beth McClure responded it could apply to a situation where a student in high school has an international transcript and placement when English is not their first language.

Julie Shea stated previously the Board asked how the new language is an improvement from the old language. Beth McClure stated new language was added to bring standards into alignment with the new English language development standards the Board adopted a year ago.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 507.17.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

B. Initial Proposal – Charter School Lease Aid (Ed 323)

Julie Shea stated the proposal has changes to ensure the information collected on the application was reflected in the rules. The date of when they are accepting applications is also being changed.

Chair Cline suggested taking away the words “to allow” on page 2.

Ann Lane noted under lease aid application, Ed 323.06, she suggested adding language, “zoning that permits a school.” Chair Cline suggested the language may not be needed because there is some flexibility in zoning. The rule has to do with lease aid and if the school has a lease, they have gained access to operate the space as a school. Julie Shea made a note to investigate the issue prior to the final proposal.

Chair Cline asked about requiring the exact square footage of the school on the application. Julie Shea responded it should be in the lease, which is required in the application. The language could be changed to approximate square footage or taken out altogether.

Chair Cline asked about language on page 4, requiring the lease to only include cost for space that is required for the operation of a charter school. The lease can include cost for space that is not used for the charter school. Some schools lease a building and rent a portion out. The lease aid will only include cost for space of the charter school.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 323 as amended.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

C. Initial Proposal – PEPP Program Approvals (Ed 601-602)

Chris Ward, Upper Valley Educator’s Institute, is a CTE member who worked on the subcommittee for the 602 procedures. They expire in March. The changes were provided.

Chair Cline asked on page 7, why classes and field placement sites to be visited was struck out. Chris Ward responded that has not been included in the MOUs requirement. More information is gained from interviews over the site visit.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 601 and Ed 602.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

D. Initial Proposal – PEPP Program Standards (607-608)

Julie Shea stated the 600s are being condensed when possible. For Ed 607 and 608, they refer to the corresponding 500 rules to decrease the need to update both 500 and 600. This aligns the licensure standards.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 607 and Ed 608.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

E. Initial Proposal – Manifest Educational Hardship (Ed 320)

Julie Shea stated there was a change in legislation in 2021 that put in language to include approved private schools. The rule is being aligned to include the language to match the statute. No other content changes were made. There were a few edits to add the definition of approved private school referencing the statute.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 307.01.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

F. Initial Proposal – Daily Physical Activity Program (Ed 310)

Julie Shea stated this rule will expire in June. It is mandated by statute. One change was made to take out a narrative piece from the beginning. No content changes were made. It is being moved to Ed 307.

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Sally Griffin, that the State Board of Education approve the initial proposal for Ed 310.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

G. Final Proposal – Speech Language Specialist (Ed 508.05)

Julie Shea stated this is a repeal and nothing has changed from the initial proposal. This is based upon a statutory change. The Office of Legislative Services (OLS) has provided consent. Steve Appleby added 15 individuals are currently licensed who hold this license. 8 hold other licenses and are assigned in other areas. 7 are in the role; 5 of which hold other endorsements. 2 individuals do not hold another endorsement. Once the final repeal is done, their current license is valid until it expires. They have been encouraged to renew now to give them three years to become a speech language pathologist. The Speech language pathologist association is working with UNH on what classes would be needed based on their experiences from doing the job.

Motion: Phil Nazzaro made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education approve the final proposal to repeal Ed 508.05.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

AGENDA ITEM IX. COMMISSIONER'S UPDATE

Commissioner Edelblut stated the tutor.com program is continuing to be rolled out. The contract is between NHED and tutor.com making tutoring available in all districts. Some districts have not begun using the program because the vendor has not completed their data privacy agreement. However, the vendor has signed the privacy agreement for the state, which has all the same coverage. This issue is being worked through.

Graduation Alliance mentoring program is also being pushed out. The same issue of the data privacy agreement has come up but should be resolved in the same way as with tutor.com.

A press release provided infographics showing cost per pupil across the state.

There have been news stories regarding teacher misconduct incidents. They are taken seriously and are being handled. Failing to report is a violation of the code of conduct and staff are being disciplined for failing to report misconduct.

ChatGPT is an AI platform which interacts in a conversational way. It will become part of education. One concern from educators is students using the platform to create essays for them. There are also questions about intellectual property.

Christine Brennan, Deputy Commissioner, stated she went to a press conference with the governor, Commissioner of Safety, and Youth Advisory Council before today's meeting. There is no safe experience using substances. There are a lot of fake pills that look like prescriptions. Parents need to be educated. Resources will be provided to superintendents. Teenagers try things and do not always make decisions that are in their best interest. Fentanyl is being discovered daily and can be deadly in one dose.

AGENDA ITEM X. OPEN BOARD DISCUSSIONS

Ann Lane brought up a discussion from the Keene State College conversation when Sally Griffin asked why students are not choosing to be educators in math and science. Ann Lane asked if there is a scholarship program for those interested in becoming math and science educators. Commissioner Edelblut responded there is a scholarship program with UNH Manchester offering an accelerated program for individuals who have STEM backgrounds in a professional field who want to go into education. The program is designed so it can be accessed when they are not working. There has been an increase in educators coming from other areas rather than traditional teacher prep programs.

Ann Lane asked if the New Hampshire standards are gone now that there is a focus on CAEP. Chair Cline responded they are not gone. There are four options to approval. Institutions can go through the Board approval process. If they go through national accreditation, the process is no longer overseen. There was a discussion about the possibility of reviewing the rules. Sally Griffin suggested reviewing the process being used by national accreditation entities, like CAEP.

AGENDA ITEM XI. TABLED ITEMS

A. Canterbury Withdrawal Feasibility Initial Study Report

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education remove this item from the table.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

B. Initial Proposal – ESOL Teacher (Ed 507.17)

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education remove this item from the table.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

AGENDA ITEM XII. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Meeting Minutes of December 8, 2022

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Ryan Terrell, that the State Board of Education accept the meeting minutes as amended.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.

AGENDA ITEM XIII. NONPUBLIC SESSION

There was no nonpublic session.

AGENDA ITEM XIV. ADJOURNMENT

Motion: Ann Lane made the motion, seconded by Phil Nazzaro, that the State Board of Education adjourn at 2:39 p.m.

Vote: The motion was approved by unanimous vote by the State Board of Education.



Secretary